Xu Peng

Amendments for the Edition of Tangut *Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra* Published in *Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia*

DOI: 10.55512/wmo642582

Abstract: Volumes from 15 to 20 of *Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia* selectively represent the *Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra* in Tangut language held by the Institute of Oriental Manuscripts of the Russian Academy of Sciences. The fundamental edition of the Collection certainly is not free from some invalidities, which became evident with the time. For the Tangut version of *Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra*, (1) some folios of different volumes were mistakenly spliced together; (2) the order of the folios of the same volumes were mixed up. The problem of identifying of the text was also aggravated by omissions made by the Tangut people, who copied the text of *Sūtra*. This paper suggests some new readings and identifications in the Tangut version of *Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra*.

Key words: Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia, Tangut documents, Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra

Preface

Among the Tangut documents housed in Russia, the majority belongs to the Buddhist literature. Among these, the Tangut text of *Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra* is notably the largest in volume, with over 1700 entries logged by Professor Evgenii Kychanov into his *Catalogue*.¹ Volumes 15 to 20 of the edition of *Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia* for the first time represent the paginated folios of the *Sūtra*. This allowed the aca-

37.

[©] Xu Peng, School of History and Civilizations, Shaanxi Normal University, Location: Xi'an, Shaanxi, China. The National Social Science Fund of China (23BMZ139) (dapengniao07@163.com)

¹ Kychanov 1999: 48–266.

demics all over the world to have a full view on this profound text and have an idea about "the relationship between Buddhism in the Tangut state and the Buddhism on the North China Plain".² Unfortunately, when the team of the compilers of the edition was working in St. Petersburg in the 1990s³ because of the extensiveness of the material and hectic schedule of the editorial work, volumes of the published Tangut text of *Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra* were not cross-referenced with the Chinese version. In this paper we try to correct some invalidities in the edition of the Tangut version of *Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra* published in the *Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia*.

Some folios of different volumes were mistakenly spliced together

One of the problems with the Tangut version of *Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra* published in *Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia* is the mistakenly done splicing of folios belonging to different parts (*juan*) of *Sūtra*, for example of part 41. There are two documents published in volume 15 of *Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia*: Инв. № 2750 and Инв. № 7731, mentioned in Professor Kychanov's *Catalogue of Tangut Buddhist Monuments* (hereinafter — *Catalogue*).⁴ The last three lines of Инв. № 2750 are the folios following the beginning of Инв. № 7731 do not belong to part 41. Subsequently, two questions arise: does the text of Инв. № 7731 belongs to part 41? And for which part of *Sūtra* does the text, not belonging to part 41, pertain to?

 $\vec{\text{H}}$ HB. № 7731 contains the conclusion of part 41. Therefore, employing a method of cross-verifying is possible to determine the order of folios. Through this approach, we can swiftly confirm that 08.1^5 "this meaning to the translation indicates that from folios from 06.1 to 07.6 belong to part 68 of *Mahā-prajñāpāramitā-sūtra*, equivalent to folios from 12.6 (the third character) to 15.2 (the seventh character) in part 68 of *Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia*. The corresponding Chinese text begins with "The Dharma

² Zhongguo shaoshumingzu gujizongmutiyao Xixiajua, 24.

³ E cang Heishuicheng wenxian (continuing edition, 1st vol. published in 1996).

⁴ Kychanov1999: 137, 59.

⁵ In this article we adopt the numbering method of Professor Han Xiaomang's on construction of the Tangut Buddhist literature corpus, and encode each part of Buddhist scriptures folio by folio and line by line, such as 08.1 is representing the first line on the 8th folio.

34

realm's tranquility remains undispersed. Shariputra! Even in the tranquility of different realms, there is no dispersion" 法雲地寂靜亦無散失。 舍利子! 異生地寂靜亦無散失⁶ and extends to "Shāriputra! Even when the realm of the ear is distant, there is no dispersion. Whether it's the realm of sound, the consciousness of the ear, or the sensations arising from contact with sound through the ear, even when these are distant, there is no dispersion" 舍利子! 耳界遠離亦無散失, 聲界、耳識界及耳觸、耳觸為緣所 生諸受遠離亦無散失.7 In folios from 01.1 to 05.6, the prevalent terms in Simultaneous locating of these terms in the database gives evidence that this section originates from part 35 "初分教誡教授品" of Mahāprajñāpāramitāsūtra. The corresponding Chinese text spans from "Venerable Sir! For all Bodhisattvas, whether their actions are distant or not distant, ultimately they cannot be grasped. Their nature is inherently non-existent"世尊! 一切菩 薩摩訶薩行遠離不遠離、尚畢竟不可得、性非有故⁸ to "Subhūti! Once again, what do you observe regarding what is said: Whether all Bodhisattyas have afflictions or are free from afflictions, does the mention of increase or decrease apply to Bodhisattvas" 善現! 汝複觀何義言: 即一切菩薩摩 訶薩行若有煩惱若無煩惱增語非菩薩摩訶薩耶.9 Volume 16 of Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia contains Инв. № 2167 and Инв. \mathbb{N}_{2130}^{10} after combining both numbers, there are still incomplete parts. Consequently, the content of folios from 01.1 to 05.6 in Инв. № 7731 serves as a suitable complementarity, rendering part 35 more comprehensive.

⁶ Taishō shinshū daizōkyō 5 1924–1932:383.

⁷ Ibid.

⁸ Ibid.: 196.

⁹ Ibid.

¹⁰ E cang Heishuicheng wenxian 16 2011: 32–37.

負徵輸設成都設備購越完就是亦能燃香菜料種 01 能設備購撥覆券取無漏職機整重能就要完又亦与總照: 既敬循辑數原統創放戰結約俱斷聽難就死發成規充 **那軒轉被職者效戰擾號就職無能報共飢機堪以及**免 敬頼備國 東難能 聚號 節時 新發露 新致原 那麼 部 敗寇着發無庸庸輕亂就配行就就進存罪衰輕数折斷改 配断敗無國備權難號竟敢敢敢無罪發散序俱然將能能 02 敗戰勞竟斷難擺開發發外發行鮮敗和新聞動 **感嗽豪感無影低動被難動情恐能認能感的致能** 編編缀載機構物新奇地整都非要要 **娜機覺感那些形形都感效及能影影能能感得那種** 戴着极無痛痛寒感兼寒息得些致寒却放在筋肉倒动 33 職艦輕粮換難務難節段聽游段無續職家非發棄意 (2-1)短翦都級原盤配聽顧動敗聽對政與鄙鄙罪軍難可能 意輯將覆駕政術新設藏為被解聯續非嚴罪若意致改 大般若波羅蜜多經卷第四十一 **环難影無能影響者非難感難對效能對效用漸漸發於感** 2 氟悲報納取戰術務發發務結婚職或粮意就必難新以 ○ 能都极無備讀 敢就我就就我我就我就放你都放你 04 → 新段戰部發親爾爾斯縣等有限成龍麻群發羅数紙類段 5 解新被無備痛筋與筋影者都致殺失難素低能激痛強強 怒死紛凝難就殺疾熱徵備御政敵漸敗無痛震或新者不 入一新新常務新政院都設情務肥亮總新政廠都設無關商 號師新有既照露舜辨覆難發新動物戰物與聽爾許 05 Инв. No. 7731 能郁侷影然意意没及離影然聽意意感難 **趆纗颩薎**続熱秡熊飾跤嘅癤圾뢨斸囒鄮窽礉礉 張貴嚴亦罪配竊發戲非将罪遭壞堪帶可謂互思若因那 俄

Pl. 1. The Tangut collection, IOM RAS. Inv. No. 7731



The order of the folios in the same volumes were mixed up

Another problem with the Tangut version of Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra published in Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia is the inaccurate order of some folios, as for example is for part 69. In the 16th volume of Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia spliced documents Инв. № 1121 and Инв. № 1222 are published.¹¹ Folio-by-folio numbering reveals that this document consists in total of 53 ff., with a partial loss on some folios. The first folio contains 6 lines, the second preserves the last 4 lines, the seventh has the first 3 lines (with the third line being fragmentary), the eighth retains the last 3 lines (with the first line being fragmentary), the twenty-third folio has the first 3 lines, and the twenty-fourth retains the last 5 lines (with slight damage of the first line). According to the Catalogue, the description for Инв. № 1121 is "part 274, with a soft white cover, 57 f. in total, fully preserved, with 7 lines per folio and 18 characters per line", whereas Инв. № 1222 is described as "part 69, 1 f., only the beginning of the text remains".¹² Upon comparison, it's evident that the designation of Инв. № 1121 in Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia is incorrect, and it requires further verification, which could be done by compering line by line with the Chinese text of Sūtra. And the correct sequence of folios of part 69 of Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia clarified, that folios from 01.1 to 01.6 are followed by folios from 08.5 to 23.3, from 02.4 to 07.3, and from 24.3 to 50.6. Even after this adjustment, there are still missing segments between folios 01.6 and 08.5 and between 23.3 and 02.4.

¹¹ E cang Heishuicheng wenxian 16 2011: 37–40.

¹² Kychanov 1999: 184, 79.

¹³ Taishō shinshū daizōkyō 5 1924–1932: 391.

診療教驗術就, and the scripture reads, "Shāriputra! The inherent nature of the realm of the body ultimately does not arise. Why? Because it is not something created" 舍利子! 身界本性畢竟不生。 何以故? 非所 / | 微糊 鍬 闡 臟 凿 编 鄃 薌 祾 叉 纁 裵 祾 糊 鍬 闡 臟". The scripture reads. "The pure precepts, patience, diligence, tranquil contemplation, and the Perfection of Wisdom do not disperse even in transcendent realms. Shariputra! The four types of tranquil contemplation and the four immeasurables, as well as the four formless absorptions, also do not disperse in transcendent realms" 淨戒、安忍、精進、靜慮、般若波羅蜜多出世間亦無散失。 舍利子! 四靜慮出世間亦無散失,四無量、四無色定出世間亦無散失.¹⁵ Comparing the above Chinese segments, we find that the latter's Chinese text appears earlier, indicating an error in the folios sequence below folio 8. Through comparison, it's observed that between the three areas of damage, namely on 13.4 and 14.5, 19.3 and 20.4, and 23.5 and 24.6, the texts before and after these areas connect seamlessly, while 26.3 and 27.3 do not match. Therefore, the previously numbered 13 and 14 should be merged into one folio, as should 19 and 20, and 23 and 24. Ff. from 08.6 to 23.3 form a rela-椭 缪 藏 / 慨 龇 藏 慨 融 藏 解 形 藏 藏 藏 慨 쟯 瓶 藏 "), the corresponding scripture reads, "Shāriputra! Inner emptiness is neither permanent nor destructible. Why? Because it is based on inherent nature. Outer emptiness, inner and outer emptiness, empty emptiness, vast emptiness, emptiness of the ultimate truth, existence is empty, non-existence is empty, ultimate emptiness, boundless emptiness, dispersed emptiness, unchanging emptiness, inherent emptiness, self-characteristic emptiness, shared characteristic emptiness, emptiness of all phenomena, emptiness that cannot be grasped, emptiness of inherent nature, emptiness of self-nature, emptiness of non-selfnature, emptiness of self-nature itself, are neither permanent nor destructi-内空非常非壞。何以故? ble" 舍利子! 本性爾故。 外空、 内外空、空空、大空、勝義空、有為空、無為空、畢竟空、無際空、

¹⁴ Ibid.

¹⁵ Ibid: 389.

散空、無變異空、	本性空、自相空、共相空、一切法空、不可得空、
無性空、自性空、	無性自性空非常非壞.16

Pages 24.3 to 24.4 of Инв. № 1121 contain "將 就 爄 衫 該 蒙 請 構 瀫 艍", corresponding to the scripture "Because they are not produced by intentional action. The realm of touch, the domain of bodily perception, and the sensations arising from contact with the body through touch ultimately do not arise. Why? Because they are not produced by intentional action. What is the reason for this" 非所作故。 觸界、身識界及身觸、 何以故? 所以者何.17 身觸為緣所生諸受本性畢竟不生。 非所作故。 Here, it is observed that 24.3 and 07.2 are contiguous, and the remnants displayed in 07.3 are exactly the portions extracted from 24.3. Thus, the correct sequence of part 69 of Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra in Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia is clarified, that is, 01.1 to 01.6 is followed by 08.5 to 23.3, 02.4 to 07.3, and 24.3 to 50.6. Even after this adjustment, there are still missing segments between 01.6 and 08.5 and between 23.3 and 02.4.

¹⁶ Taishō shinshū daizōkyō 5 1924–1932: 390.

¹⁷ Ibid.: 391.

羅義凝視得發改與然痛死 **銀 竊 截 请 释 漸 聽 聂 聂 聂 魏 藏 林 希 稱 春 義 義 對稅恭請艱濃義漸嚴義類麼減職粮亦,漸**盡 竊酸稱清凝獲循職嚴者漸獨發傳續嚴續被 2 5 5 係殺磷離難被殺狷新獨贏贏麻敝離賤藏 ○ 後蒲鼎線瓶我紙漉漉贏贏廠廠廠廠嚴張我 離賦儀就微循贏贏贏贏嚴機能機 風雞強殺難攝贏贏贏虛熊嚴酸臟艱我聽開 (10-1)~ 雜截截離藏藏贏贏贏嚴嚴嚴嚴嚴嚴嚴難 ◎ 節殺龐萬敷張緩殺新康離者維難應壽報新 03 - 机类能 大般若波羅蜜多經卷第六十九 6 緯濃報充藏將發成非發和成統能新發 敵無後戚非藏原後魏卷魏府務紙號難陸 風養無服業藏無袋難發號情殺鏡機聽搖 ~ 魏羅離卷產羅發為我無義意藏難稱風精 ~ 嚴東藏縣機難發點情殺流燈行了離就羅服 70 4 再表成非要無我就得就得我就感感就聽難 5 亂執發彦產親務務衛務衛務 ○ 無殺難發症原殺道藏難殺難難將 隶赢縣殺魏務就時散難藏藏縣縣處熱聽驚 俄 MHB.No.1121 1222 魏務產雜錢綿殺銀竊嚴虛嚴虛虛離開發嚴非 2 藏無殺難發結情殺履虛藏離虛敝贏敵 ~ 載贏虛難講職將發戲表藏得發 54 龍繞藏嚴嚴虛虛難纖虛截狼惡亞難卷產雜發 5 病發銀為敷產成離嚴服兼激無殺難釋為情 ○ 殺着盛虛離虛嚴嚴意意意意意意意 養嚴表藏無後難帶就情殺難聽嚴嚴虛虛難

The Tangut collection, IOM RAS. Inv. No. 1121 1222 (1-10)

Pl. 3.

覆嚴張意無後亂得黏情私隨聽嚴嚴嚴虛虛難 織意敢艱產產艱養產業發精發無截應虛嚴 **羅風將養戚表藏紙殺難務就將後離成感** N **疏艇往殺艦殺艱產速難講賊將發艱艱艱 牧**難奪號틁殺礁織藏縣羅確康難羅催散號擺 90 4 **疏熱養產羅我病殺範漸激新蘇蘇離解發蘇** LO **朱藏無殺難卷就將殺難處於賺遠越為就** 0 殺艱竈產難攝嚴將後戚非嚴無殺難發號 N 後疑攝藏無於意識無刻敵難產成 N 髮紙後紙竊嚴貢疏離離解發驗樂 80 職御得粮意備稅職職者得新發財利最新度 **赤鯖粃慮臟肴肴輕薪請意見飛卖素構挑慮臟** (10-2)**希循風蕭雜號聽度後微就毫續熱驟慮有**循 羅新截病備換意識挑慮機奇術預線獲術效謝 0 60 厭紙佩藏寬發編粮貝引聽識悲離批應職新精 4 **豨翁敽瘕瀮艱難悲뺆粃慮懒豹葯ź焉濡**斱 大般若波羅蜜多經卷第六十九 **乘殺毫備揪慮壞**希將惡薪發虛虛號補挑慮驗 **希得稅效益產備兼職職前將銀薪嚴非該嚴**盡 補挑儀嚴奇看有我忍得有殺得流散死殺亦殺 靈穀鄉非茂貝胤得離意輸兼機織者將範薪發 贏贏截飛繡挑艬巖秀得罷聽發贏贏贏號殺詭鮒 桃廣機有精配新發概結解離法備機有 10 4 5 精織難與麥產輸稅礦職有清嚴霜發時產後 **報贏贏贏恭́́́́́́無撤慮燉肴焉翁嚴臻職贏贏**漉沸 **纰儀臟者循難痛殺藏驟綺悲輸挑慮職者**? **新结敗贏銷粮意綺羅爾稱綺靜藏這** 俄 MHB.No.1121 1222 ○ 嚴赦結竟結離視結產補我應職者稍嚴薪嚴強 **张绮毫繡桃麋懒者稍量融結與聽結離哀結** 00 係緩鬆結緩難綺難縫結離結結構 4 D 批慮機術猜鑑新發這義意意補機優幾新得 ○ 亂緒滾穀藏意號輸挑慮擬者將銀薪酸能殺 狼新疏福有鏡既鹿壽椒稱熱發號 1 **戚難爺薪殼來離極聽慮機術猜艱難發**

The Tangut collection, IOM RAS. Inv. No. 1121 1222 (1-10)

Pl. 4.

	就縫滾戳竊尋離我情磨者者勇業原受者者
	截新充福有強死虛壽融為難奏強
-	既難亂薪殺張聽極聽懷機者得艱聚我發露聽
U	亂聽棒將胤將殺繼鄧薪發漸嚴不敢有死
C	離抵乾晨殿有得若派般在書意奉奉張殿有
+	結難統熱惶能聽慮機為結塞薪發虛就離聽
C	魔機者得嚴遇有責犯就能聽慮機有得能調
0	儀貌離聽朦朧希得這羅難敢聽就聽聽朦朧
1	彩飛薪粮蔵產離離機者猜穩虛虛虛虛虛
	贏殺藏殺難產意難難聽聽機以者
-	藏極聽慮機有得這處意機感感意意
0	浱唜艞艗蘸臟补筕錵 蕭截隘處難藏機
t	乔 钙擺產儘機產機當嚴強產
	戰機有得嚴痛殺仍底郁竊懷依得難成別
	聽張船 新發 为 該 載 而 丞 都 不 不 承 者 有 者 承 者 者 者 者 者 者 者 者 者 者 者 者 者 者 者
1	新發責就概駕懷嚴有稱設或責能
	貢該銀贏處難概藏機衛續難竊意聽聽
V	充廣驟有綺麗或混處之能說發發意處
182	難搬聽機職有請號罰發結或能聽聽機備請
0 +	張羅難藏聽嚴聽聽嚴機發行結毫漸發破有虛
2	極聽懷嚴有結衛而嚴意見聽覺強嚴嚴有結號
	竊骸亂慮嚴有統執備漸續發就敢難意意
20	流非罷能難器嚴難弱派認派而虛儀有消邪漸發者, 通罪有有意情者, 到天之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之之
1 1	庫藏紙蘸機職備結我意虛銀藏藏藏藏藏
	補養嚴難難嚴難產嚴將發嚴死將發慮死將強懷嚴
U U	既懸飛藏構愧藏罰聽嚴續聽藏而偏藏聽爾得意意
2	
1	~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~
2	之言自己的人民人民民人民人民民族政
0	教 · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
1	有結金有發行可能能能機像有將新發峰新穩
	行うしいしてとるなくなんて、石を設ちるろうで、
J C	ち前支前方、田道支下了日本支有人由
0 +	the set of
+	~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~
0	距爾發藏都發離竊備織有將然為蘇將點發發

Pl. 5. The Tangut collection, IOM RAS. Inv. No. 1121 1222 (1-10)

		the store the man with the sol of the man the store the store the sol	
17	5	死前發藏無較無痛機備有前循循循循減發發	
	9		
	7	效益難竊嚴嚴前循罪者發者務罪發嚴難意慮懷	
	-	有循循錯續循續發行經激若激素凝聚激激	
	2	并發見虛構觀覺產廣嚴有新運動發贏職發	
	3	紙黏機織者綺潔就發贏過駕發船霜機巖有	
-0	4	結循痛酸脫難無配擺無嚴嚴有精嚴統難要	
	5	ᢞૣૡૢૢૢૢૢૢૢૢ ᠵ 御 御 御 御 御 御 御 御 御 御 御 御 御 御 御 御 御 御	
	9	織奇得秘嚴登發贏贏熾產廉嚴有將號棄後	
	2	羅繫結備痛懷徵有綺麗充為販高結發書待	
	-	聽 蕭 張 着 義 義 就 就 就 就 就 就 就 就 就 就 就 就 就 就 就 就 就	
19	2	結離藏職職者捐配竊發聽我結難聽職	
	3	有為軍風結貝縣結聽夜將書結緩靈結機	
	4	結龍統結離總結幕機將衛衛蘭職者都都	
20	5	The second secon	4)
2	9	I with the state of the state o	(10-4)
	7		-
		航翔銀蕭敷龝贏贏虛魚魚龐熾難蓋黃蕭燕	
	2	Till be a der har bout the court of some to state the bout the so	十九
		こしきにはえたはきもうべきできべきほぼきになる人脈に知道	第六-
_	~	Ester Fall Downed have be a trucket the bar and a low be be be be	策
,	4	The to the frankes have be due to the land a line of the best	經卷
	5	The states be and the bear has been been been been been been been bee	AA .
	9	脫臟穀緩發磷就燒西發這藏就敢聽就放機	蜜
	1	原題嚴疑發請與煩問之之を、近有支張死死後死	支羅
	1	既機豪孫殺離開總部發聽蕭慶感感	若波
	0		大般
22	~		×
	4		55
	L	離疏脈贏截贏截線贏疏難應機機機凝緩殺	1222
	9		21
	2		.No.1121
	-	就機龐臟凝緩發離萬難發統	No.
2	0		B.l
N	~		M _{HB} .
	4	I see the set of the test of the test of the test	策

Pl. 6. The Tangut collection, IOM RAS. Inv. No. 1121 1222 (1-10)

	4	銀蕭職賣感感機機聽機聽聽發離屍聽感聽者為非罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪罪	
	2	疏弄雄歲抵秀很秀意意意意意意意意	
	9	張激請胤德極我都前發孤為成嚴嚴嚴嚴	
	1.	碇壳紙概繳瓶機難疑殺醋風機截殺紙竊酸酸紙無機聽後請與聽我聽感聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽聽	
	-	1月1日花裂配霧影器發播開發商帶異葉基素	
	5	には一日、1日、1月、20万 まで、20万 生産、1月月、1月、1月、1月、1月、1月、1月、1月、1月、1月、1日、1日、1日、1日、1日、1日、1日、1日、1日、1日、1日、1日、1日、	
	4	— 是我就能够被罵殺 帶 希 考 考 考	
-	5		
	9	稅銀氨稅煮非兼機難竊積難漸漸應應原機難既嚴係職該罪稅止難將強強機發將發講與職機就就敢難難就就不許強強強強者強強者強強者強強者將將將將將將將將非非非非非非非非非非非非非非非非非	
1	1 1	mn mx m m m m m m m m m m m m m m m m m	
	2	~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~	
	m	能紙蠹散藏無覆露到那邊備薄御頭守道	-5)
	3	我新俱要能當著贈商前等原語言語	(10-
	4	介底難嚴責敵艱贏速難務府就要病者範續聽聽離難機聽我聽我聽我聽我聽我聽我聽我聽我聽我聽我聽我聽我聽我	
	6 5		+ JL
	7	免犯能意能能能能得要謝請預報考慮	Xt
	L	紫影無影響影響得帶發發露着那時	卷弹
	2	該載贏駝號養產雜薮焉殺鄭蕭蕭聽始承蒲團	大般若波羅蜜多經卷第六十九
	2	離朝成非戚非麗縣我點將我就情者就緩發將 释發廠非藏聽後聽卷就得致我聽難聽	邂
	5 4	然成親織聽感發展聽致猜發感着發發了了 請原根等原書意意, 是是是	波羅
	9	羅風群燈既張影聽發聽發號情影商臺南到	股若
	7	藍睛私特覺底朱鬆振殺熱秀恭們我強強之	K
	1	那般沙龐聽聽意沙備發夜游影却老鄧遠覺	55
	2	瓜新離照將發成寒發無發就發點得致或發離	1222
	3	既將養戚表藏無者藏者就將與發展就	121
	5 4	統難難無難難發霧發發發展發展後就要要認為	Инв.No.1121
	9	骸 薛 羅 羅 辯 卷 想 恭 恭 恭 恭 恭 恭 恭 恭 恭 恭 恭 恭 恭 恭 恭 恭 恭 恭	B.N
	L	藏庫殺藏藏藏職養新養離機藏嚴藏	
		費颪犯為意慮憑脫弱雅藏醋脫藏弄強灑耀	俄

Pl. 7. The Tangut collection, IOM RAS. Inv. No. 1121 1222 (1-10)

	2 1	~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~
		魏直離扁高意兼甚得重張精為壽原離產與將
	3	
	4	凝藏無俱處無無與有有有意意形。
	5	號蕭聽障釋新廣張遵離風帶覆敝兼聽駕殺
	9	魏養結情報榮意義類魏亦而凝藏表新康 藏
1	1	題講虛稱禮意素豪惹後飄巷黏情稅與極藏
-		廉殊為處義遵難嚴職意意漸處當處 著者
C	7	a) was a for all a distant a distributed to
C	2	氟卷詭債後為發權摘獲為飲權風將發幣款
	4	艱紙殺難養就時稅疏蟲艱緩類清撒新教 權
L	2	為履精成務產業我為後統者養且難豪祿離
	0	释卷成素凝凝後觀發就時後因儲效犯然難
1	1	敷養藏難離戚無卷瓶兼藏無發觀巷黏情
		雖總藏嚴因贏豪點儀敢儀意聽幾新發
0	7	船蕭歲顏備務備就將發服養聽發聽發聽
(2	原殺攝濕幾新效機福福羅嚴直發統撤風力肅
	4	微蒲風将養煎業豪孫我點卷就原表編紙
L	S	振新常勉難嚴員才肅縱發於意義数新發配薪酸
	0	藏羅蒙藏蒲麗新養照兼嚴無發無聽
1	1	循綺維結難豪養雜與將養應素藏縣發點卷
		號將後編羅藏稱藏藏蒙數聽將編編蘇文義
c	V	發度駕發銷機贏新發低高時與開發人
c	n	孫教魏養施情後終效違稱風將養虛非藏羅
V	4	表熱恭就情積虛處意意成成意於效益帮求者數
-	0	將後駕斎渡往衣猿薩風將巷原非蟲縣務敷
4	0	卷瓶俱發酒發流稍稍微循疏散花艱薄散
Г	H	兼魏許成因梳維嚴備機備將機能
	-	恭就傳發疏緩嚴縁并於鐵點難并於貝梳結
C	V	縣恭辰駕敷總後擺蕭豫贏贏푫職風 接機
0	2	既非濃游發熱帶熱情感帶露發發調
Y	4	張風 務 卷 風 意 者 感 感 意 意 意 意 意 意 意 意 意 意 意 意 意 意 意 意
-	n	統贏贏養藏機積贏贏應獲發港透機
-	9	熊斎潑慌業備職職職務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務務
	1	卷就傳殺凝機視勞稱强罪發慌兼嚴疑發
		紀卷疑情表維羅說深麗雞解聽嚴感

Pl. 8. The Tangut collection, IOM RAS. Inv. No. 1121 1222 (1-10) -45

餐說傳殺線視廠稱融將養職業嚴係發 亂養疑傳教縫聽說疑照難解離嚴懲 ○ 疹糕殺得殺爺竊截筋處後發聽福禱離就 ~ 减素蟲係養難養 魏牌祿 務 鐵 發 職 碼 碼 講 4 嚴無養嚴非義無殺難養就情殺難嚴強 35 ○ 新聽聽感結構與將發燈未發發都聽說情殺 羅戴術歌飛結難意結聽爾張為難撒給執者 結脱報約結毫結視視為補配將發脫非敵能 ~ 義號發號情後雜擬激緩聽數結難難嚴難 ~ 發液雜發源殺號漸酸就非為講就將發就非 36 - 截線後熱察就情殺軍限將員聽然聽麼幸結 5 緩棄將嚴充就總許翻維為奪徵若稱風将 ~ 養戚悲惑孫殺親卷疏情發緒擺嚴孫就 魏徽雜機衛務養能發睛数距竊職職 (10-7)私鮮養敵杀藏總發藏者就情殺難德 ○ 離脫無發就意嚴艱酸難發號情後強聽影 ~ 酒義截漸總覆機覆將產雜發碼殼配竊藏 4 機艱酸新嚴報或嚴無將發施禁聽發號 俄 MHB.No.1121 1222 大般若波羅蜜多經卷第六十九 37 ○ > 養得戚素雜薄嚴報漸離薄 ※ 瑟紙取線點 衛徵殺殺殺殺殺無將發離禁锋緩報滴胤為影 **縣稅馜蕭截濾禱曍藏稅棗贏講閱藏鋒艱** 2 義義義感義兼房離該結與激離藏無機發 ○ 朱緯緩顏慌顏發爺為蘇竊酸號氣難搖講開藏發 30 **艱福請鼎藏辭義衆義氣義義義義兼張離茲錯** 4 ○ 後爺為截爺熱蒜鼎豪殺衰亂醋祿感錄艱非 養產義級義將於勸發精驗能離養將醫院 **朱锋藏魏為熊為殺蘇病散亦福好系融魏藤** 2 風藏發藏離離風藏絲藏東戴蘇藏藏 ○ 徹茲無疑激難兼兼無將養戚悲錯者流循約者 33 → 福敏為熊為發範續發露熱講開露殺我聽 **曍纖辯疲衆義棄義褒惫瘕稅於難痰縃疑殺艱** 5 ○ 離義將發獻兼着新義勉為胤為發話 斎 愁 這 **羅船 截感就帶執藏炎 莨爾 镰 秕 篾 痒 髲 怍 髲 돏**

46

The Tangut collection, IOM RAS. Inv. No. 1121 1222 (1-10)

PI. 9.

		離遼將發疏禁釋對嚴勉顏龐顏殺馜蕭敲流
		羅 蕭 嚴 羅 都 羅 鼎 惠 憲 義 憲 義 義 義 義 義 義 義 義 義 義 義 義 義 義 義 義
	-	義家義相近勉殺為錦微懲聽聂稱發慨恭
	2	新產黨兼嚴職難為離為務難者難職處 離離
40	3	藏殺義聽講開藏錄義兼兼義義義狼務務
4	4	痰結雜懲艱難聂將發脫募華新虛感為關衛
	10	炭產蕭殼感虛產權產與虛贏殺難藏意難
	9	離龐憲殺轰離講開憲釋義非憲新憲氣家義和
	2	於截我將戰難數職裏新發脫素棒漸應成
	1	難嚴戚殺嚴重張難為戚為我都意意意
	2	風震發寬贏離風震雜發表表意意意意意意
	3	敬 袋 馬 魏 幾 截 截 兼 意 兼 卷 備 素 席 產 病 席 精 意
41	4	我碼肅殼清疏虛賺虛頗贏截虛發藏
	-0-1	御殿藏後義職備風藏精憲武義義義義義者
	9	於截殺馬線幾艱難竟無積候蘇鋒新活底難
	1	織庫豪戴福意難為備為發循漸散催嚴離開
	-	戴張義編備與義辑義朱表義義成義和於難
	2	茲結雜幾截聽裏都養礙非祥。。 新福虛銷
	3	隙湧表號蕭截駕贏虛備離或腳幅後後張艱
42	4	充無無視意殺夷氟補風義雄夷求夷蓋夷家
	5	義税委務衛務撤載職 東州 務 康 赤 赤 赤 赤 赤 赤 赤 赤 ま ま ま ま ま ま ま ま ま ま ま
	9	感難機督散艱痛敢難頑難費發循痛酸折感
	1	離脱囊殺痰癫離膨寬雄張葉素素義義者素和
		長雅衰為雜難兼離義省,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,
	2	教我羅斎教羅南斯騰原刻常刻後戴花亦難
	3	離視截殺痕龐羅脫截雜囊兼兼義藏藏嚴義報
43	4	茨雜我將雜載兼聽賣將發腳禁堪對辦意 於
	2	施速熱難。所發戴一兩強難崩减為殺號蕭幾
	9	方面補脫或殺強職難戚或堪義非義義義私
	1	靈報感離爱無鏡難離張將發離號
	-	流續慌張我號蕭殺發疏賣爆流 張勇嚴寡嚴
	2	艱荒流難講風盧殺痰聽講風藏養新囊禁囊
44	3	燕藏教戴親戚戚親聽意無張戲之
	4	羅者徵意聽嚴責嚴嚴嚴嚴嚴嚴嚴
	2	微那疏潘硯畫殺夷聽蒲風盡蜂蒐非義薰
		家還報張離該結備機難聽讓稱積嚴禁籍問

Pl. 10. The Tangut collection, IOM RAS. Inv. No. 1121 1222 (1-10)

	散那處備風處殺痰竊漏風盧鋒黃寡羨薰
44	叙遠我既離怒結無難難義無預後感赤幕新
	一瓶盛續撒得發擺續發聽露聽聽風聽提透服
	一般艱荒虛聽離龐重殺意聽離視應接張禁棄
	之產產我意兼原職我將絕強艱難義將發處禁
	~~ 祥萧縣或藏藏藏藏藏藏意表施為旗為後衛漸
45	4 截約底備風歲我藏福備風藏裕藏非重張重
~	5東重班於御我為總截聽讓我得很成我推對
	0 結本顏脫顏發郁着發統難點意能虛構開藏
	了殺渡羅備龐盧釋義東義義義義衰衰狼根感激
	- 馬羅難艱聽義無意得意能意
	○ 續胤績殺能蕭藏粮打龐備風藏殺黨羅講開
	♡ 藏權囊集囊充意意義兼兼成離殺結雜難難
46	4 囊释養戚外籍請張力權為應為發羅蜜酸務
	and we have and have a hard and and and and and have and all had been
	5 寬敷敷抵務總強務總職還將積施禁權 01 5 氯惠意力欄體嚴豐素表爾清爾圖書書書書書書 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6 6
	in the set of the set
	~ 終襄聽購點聽難嚴兼義義義義義義義
	2 為張戲戴聽裏無我無非常有意得有意意 九
47	55 寬東東港於福我所羅戴那藏真佛後成恭祥 經4 霧積極線構配處殺或藏備虛意接無意律意等者 94 總截越總補配處殺或藏備虛意律重非意意 55 約 前萬敢難堪所遵然執承撒豪殺病非承接推舉 六
7	5 重承乘相成離我為雜機艱難我將後成集辞 若
	· 新亂亂職號號號發發發漸漸微薄發能痛激 金
~	the way way and way had not sent that had been been been been been been been bee
	- 寬抵於御我將張鐵聽聽我將覺施非接新得 沒
	~ 藏頭瓶衛後部衛衛機藏庫粮藏藏藏機藏備 若
~	n 琴藏瓶總藏備藏無養養意和新藏機藏那為 ³
40	4 報義離離義為難意意離機意不過
	5 歲風街藏露視藏露那新露麗藏
	· 雜配嚴緒義寡義藏義教義相於触我為難難 ·
	▶ 艱難。黃無發風羨薄覆意聽戀問罰萬融贏 · 21
	- 綺麗類教
	○ 截着散傳將新廣藏職補與激我讓職權嚴 N
43	·> 椿義隶素蕭義義義義務務截義為編微職職
4	· 豪雅養凝集幕情辨漸處意意有情势激漸 N
	しまえ きみ ひちち ちに 南京・オ州を派言 三丁 常筑 会部 まみな 本川 ふけ 子は 主用 化化な

Pl. 11. The Tangut collection, IOM RAS. Inv. No. 1121 1222 (1-10)



rl. 12. The Tangut collection, IOM RAS. Inv. No. 1121 1222 (1–10)

The errors of the Tangut scribes and editors

When the Tangut people copied the *Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra* published now in *Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia*, they made an omission in its title, and that caused the content and title of the scripture to be inconsistent. Scholars were unable to identify it and registered it according to its literal form. For the 409th part of the Tangut version of *Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra*, Professor Kychanov recorded two entries, *H*HB. № 5092 and *H*HB. № 670. *Catalogue* described *H*HB. № 5092 as "part 409, manuscript format, 34.5×710 cm, damaged at the beginning, 16 characters per line".¹⁸ *H*HB. № 670 it described as "part 409, manuscript format, 34.5×945 cm, entire text preserved, 17 characters per line".¹⁹ According to this description, *H*HB. № 670 is complete. When the 409th part was published in *Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia*, *H*HB. № 670 and *H*HB. № 5092 were put together.²⁰ However, upon comparison, it was found that their content is different.

Considering the initial damage in Инв. № 5092, examining the end of the volume can shed light on this issue. In Инв. № 670, the final segment runs from 13.09 "漏羹嫋藏腳敲颳飯藏酸 循 靜 鄧 藏 颜 蔽" to 13.27 "策藏贏贏脫斌發 i, with related scripture starting from "At that moment, Subhūti once again addressed Long Life Shariputra, saying, 'If a Bodhisattva abides in such various meditative absorptions'" 爾時, 善現複語具壽舍利子言:"若菩薩摩訶薩安住如是諸三摩地", ending with "Because of the equality of the nature of all phenomena" 以一切法性平等故.²¹ However, in Инв. № 5092, the final section in the Tangut language begins at 10.05 "版数G 藏 飯 飯 酸 贏 蓙 纖 箙 飯 showing significant discrepancies from the aforementioned text in Инв. № 670 from 13.09 to 13.27. This indicates that Инв. № 5092 does not contain the content of part 409. By searching for the descriptors in Инв. № 5092, we can confirm that this identification pertains to the Tangut version of the 419th part of Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra, with the related scripture starting from "Again, Subhūti! The sensations arising from past eve contact as a condition are empty" 複次, 善現! 過去眼觸為緣所生諸

¹⁸ KYCHANOV 1999: 49.

¹⁹ Kychanov 1999: 49.

²⁰ E cang Heishuicheng wenxian 20 2013: 157–164.

²¹ Taishō shinshū daizōkyō 7 1924–1932: 51.

受過去眼觸為緣所生諸受空 and ending with "Sensations arising from future and present contact with the ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind as conditions are also empty. The nature of emptiness is also empty. Emptiness within emptiness cannot even be grasped, let alone the sensations arising from future and present contact with the ear, nose, tongue, body, and mind as conditions within emptiness can be grasped" 未來現在耳、鼻、舌、身、 意觸為緣所生諸受即是空,空性亦空,空中空尚不可得, 何況空中有未來現在耳、鼻、舌、身、意觸為緣所生諸受可得.²²

At position 10.26 in Инв. № 5092, the title tag reads "統" (大), which corresponds to the case number of volumes within the range of the 411th to the 420th volumes.²³ This indicates that the scribe omitted the character "茂" (十) in the volume number "姻 熱 兪 尔 四百十九第) mentioned in the colophon, instead writing "姻 熱 尔 四百九第). Consequently, the compilers of *Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia* failed to thoroughly examine its content and mistakenly attributed it to the 409th part of *Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra*. In reality, Инв. № 5092 contains the content of the 419th part. As *Catalogue* doesn't explicitly document the 419th part, and *Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia* in its 20th issue didn't publish the image plates of the 419th part, the content from Инв. № 5092 is a valuable supplement.

-51

²² Ibid.: 106–107.

²³ Mylnikova & Peng 2013: 93.

重复短薪務 砥循抵致後續每戚錢新峰將雜時請發 循報跟疑該得務教成得務教務感等数報機部 **敬 藝 贏 敬 塑 縣 弟 跋 總 舜 敬 兼 嫩 弗 敷 遊 速 微窥澗焌蘇稍敞流斑報流移旗鏈輻 缀流 黨律調應減我類数編紙罰意賺該發降稅 萊備嚴肅機難雜罰為隱聽聽提疑罰發雜** 調 舜委局藏戚艱疏亂漸豫戰衙勞張漸敬難 **赤线徒死成移腹缩竟分辞濃減成亦井爽** 蘇爾張敵應離放與敏疏其循者盜稱通為 胤禛輕顏嚴疑罰幾贏點殺徒既疏萬敗變 陵谷施愈静成發照疫脈流或弱感勉慨將 低號耀鏡或勒跟導得總能成都跟結務 儀亦靜賺鐘為獻虛為搖致嚴係務強 Pl. 13. (13 - 13)無張幾成愚疏新發融點發疑聽聽聽聽聽 **能後張感寡效意味并孤難再感怒意感激**激 商每戚結義脈視前戚給讀儀循張義續褒 键 MHB.No.670 大般若波羅蜜多經卷第四百九 既就循极臟動機聽義新麗乘顏服務嚴絕 **該能強職義新麗氣調服務嚴難發薪敬藏新 敬哀戚龍聽豪調麗狼竊痛病報瞭婆激弱** 敵孽流為職幾新聽我聽殺都欲蘇於藏精欲擺 **新聽袁新應義筋概報威變激祛藏茲新應義** 領毗報戚攀廉壽新機藏新教散羅盛蟲那 雜祿鴯鴯贏舉無我殺 **漱祛痰新康亟頌風就潮周與机**然

The Tangut collection, IOM RAS. Inv. No. 670

径行言征敬能认改良妨觉取制致威非欲 隆列有風藏總嚴嚴嚴能有嚴嚴難嚴者强 び以上成 戚就着被凑强意敢放我而能继续感感感 贏疏離藏釀輸溝級藏嚴殺贏號難發 **欲藏敲殺配處難發減隊就被相遇引有視殺難 毫疣難激凝症後仍有祛酸線能激激器** 職等旅意他行考認該般意直難該機審發 而随行育魂敲殺而寇亂竊窩藏緩離滅感 **秘討殺贏號難禁緊請發將殺機嚴難嚴難** The Tangut collection, IOM RAS. Inv. No. 5092 配近鄉城裏散氣敞有滾嚴補嚴升雜發術 協藏新戲殺或該緣配能難羅發漏陵蘇激 酸構該條律各藏該銀贏症難駕發精嚴將 **於該城溝谷或設設意思就感感激意間者** 遼藏編歲前能数新照感補酸緣俸後就設 10 - 10)Pl. 14. **戦**罷產艱難養發發度駕獵藏續滾凝能 **手魂澎線這一就離难該新發務發液凝減** 初亨與該線贏成鄉線豪酸線風升藏霧衝 大般若波羅蜜多經卷第四百九 豪彷柔及為婚補嚴線派這種行言就該幾 亂疏灑號發設陵衛藏藏藏職隊羅敵亦 行育魂設能配能難数將敏感設發爆奪 **敏能能行有魂殺嚴虛就難聽讓酸難地有** 龍餅嚴有雅致煩尬豪備限嚴俸寡流為 **豜豸礘敲縱贏颩鄭瀧髮譈焓 歐議意想·既義顏既放鍋樹純 靴聽統** 鮮原恐有筋該 "我我我能能就就经 " 策 MHB.No.5092

Conclusion

The fundamental edition of *Heishuicheng Manuscripts Collected in Russia*, including the Tangut version of *Mahāprajñāpāramitā-sūtra*, certainly is not free from some invalidities, which became evident for the researchers with the time. In the process of study of the Tangut literature published facsimile, we need to pay attention to both its textual and codicological features, and identify the title of the manuscript after rigorous analysis. Mistakenly splicing together mixed texts can belong to different periods and are subject to thorough comparative research. We should keep in mind that when publishing literature, we should avoid arbitrary splicing or cutting, but for this we should seek for objective information.

References

- *E cang Heishuicheng wenxian 15* 俄藏黑水城文獻 15 [Heishuicheng manuscripts collected in Russia. Vol. 15]. Ed. by St. Petersburg Branch of the Institute of Oriental Studies of the Russian Academy of Sciences, Institute of Nationality Studies of the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences and Shanghai Chinese Classics Publishing House. Shanghai: Guji chubanshe, 2011.
- *E cang Heishuicheng wenxian 16* 俄藏黑水城文獻 16 [Heishuicheng manuscripts collected in Russia. Vol. 16]. Ed. by St. Petersburg Branch of the Institute of Oriental Studies of the Russian Academy of Sciences, Institute of Nationality Studies of the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences and Shanghai Chinese Classics Publishing House. Shanghai: Guji chubanshe, 2011.
- *E cang Heishuicheng wenxian 20* 俄藏黑水城文獻 20 [Heishuicheng manuscripts collected in Russia. Vol. 20]. Ed. by St. Petersburg Branch of the Institute of Oriental Studies of the Russian Academy of Sciences, Institute of Nationality Studies of the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences and Shanghai Chinese Classics Publishing House. Shanghai: Guji chubanshe, 2013.
- KYCHANOV, Evgenii I. 1999: Katalog tangutskikh buddiiskikh pamiatnikov [Catalogue of Tangut Buddhist Written Monuments]. Kyoto: Kyoto University.
- Taishō shinshū daizōkyō 大正新修大藏經 [Buddhist Canon Compiled under the Taishō Era (1912–1926)]. Ed. by Takakusu Junjirō 高楠順次郎 and Watanabe Kaigyoku 渡邊海旭 et al. Tokyo: Taishō issaikyō kankōkai 大正一切經刊行會, 1924–1932.
- MYLNIKOVA, Yulia & PENG, Xiangqian 彭向前 2013: "Xixia wen Daboruojing hanhao bushi" 西夏文《大般若經》函號補釋 [Supplementary Interpretation of the Serial Number of the Tangut text of Mahāprajňāpāramitā Sūtra]. *Tangutology* 10: 90–93.
- Zhongguo shaoshu mingzu guji zongmu tiyao. Xixiajuan 中國少數民族古籍總目提要• 西夏卷 [Summary of the General Catalogue of Chinese Ethnic Minority Ancient Book. Tangut Volume]. Ed. by the National Ethnic Minority Ancient Books Sorting and Research Office of the State Ethnic Affairs Commission. Beijing: China Encyclopedia Publishing House, 2019.